

Pursuing Plagiarism



Philippine Council for Health Research and Development
Philippine Association of Medical Journal Editors
Asia Pacific Association of Medical Journal Editors
Peer Review , Editing and Train the Trainers (Part 2)
Workshop

Plaza del Norte Hotel, Laoag City, August 7, 2013

JF Lapeña Jr. M.A., M.D., F.P.C.S.
lapenajf@upm.edu.ph



University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



Vesalius (1514 BC) spent sleepless nights after shipping the blocks of his anatomical drawings to a printer in Basel. He feared that his rival anatomists might seize those blocks and print them under their own names.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION

University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER



Pursuing Plagiarism



Even the great Galen was said to have copied several concepts from his predecessors and claimed them as his own.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION



University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



Lavoisier (16th century) stole the discovery of Oxygen from Priestley and the discovery of water from Cavendish. Fortunately the credit is restored to original discoverers in both cases.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION

University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER



Pursuing Plagiarism



In fact Priestley himself got the idea (Idea theft) from Cavendish. Michael Faraday, John Dalton, and many more of those days got ideas copied from Cavendish.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION

University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER



Pursuing Plagiarism



Charles Darwin got the idea of “Descent of Man” from John Hunter’s collection and writings, but carefully avoided mentioning the fact (albeit he referred to Hunter in several places of his book).

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION

University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER



Pursuing Plagiarism



Even John and his brother William Hunter accused each other of plagiarism and separated on the issue of credit of discovery of placental circulation.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:

<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION

University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER



Pursuing Plagiarism



After the demise of John Hunter his brother-in-law Sir Everard Home stole Hunter's research findings (lab notes) and published a series of highly acclaimed papers in his name. He was even awarded an FRS based on the plagiarized publications.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION



Pursuing Plagiarism



He was caught when he tried to burn Hunter's original notes which were no longer required of him.

The smoke evolving from the chimney provoked an inquiry and a court case thereon.

Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

INTRODUCTION



Pursuing Plagiarism



In the August 2010 issue of Anesthesia & Analgesia, a highly regarded specialty journal, five researchers from the University of Pennsylvania, led by Andrew Ochroch, made a remarkable confession.

Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. Anesth Analg. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.

INTRODUCTION



Pursuing Plagiarism



Their article in the May issue of A&A on ventilation of patients recovering from bariatric surgery plagiarized a 2009 paper in a competing publication, Anesthesiology, written by the same group.

Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. Anesth Analg. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.

INTRODUCTION



Pursuing Plagiarism



“We sincerely apologize for the inappropriate and unacceptable intellectual overlap and self-plagiarism of our paper ... published in Anesthesiology.”

Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. Anesth Analg. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.

INTRODUCTION



Pursuing Plagiarism



“In presenting the results of the two studies, we duplicated much of the Introduction, structure of the Methods and Results, and the Discussion sections. Despite the data being original in each paper, this is a clear violation of the policies [of both journals].”

Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. Anesth Analg. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.

INTRODUCTION



Pursuing Plagiarism



This session will discuss:

- The definitions of plagiarism, technical plagiarism and self-plagiarism;
- The general types of plagiarism; and
- The 2011 Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) Code of Conduct and Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors for pursuing misconduct.

OBJECTIVES



Pursuing Plagiarism



This presentation is based on:

Lapeña JF. Plagiarism and plunder: Fabrication and falsification.
Philippine Journal of Otolaryngology Head and Neck Surgery 2010
Jul-Dec 25 (2):4-5.



REFERENCE

University of the Philippines Manila
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



Plagiarism

- from “Latin *plagiarius* ‘kidnapper, seducer, plunderer,’ used in the sense of ‘literary thief’ by Martial, from *plagium* ‘kidnapping,’ from *plaga* ‘snare, net.’”¹

¹"Plagiarism," in *Online Etymology Dictionary*. Douglas Harper, Historian. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.etymonline.com/index.php?term=plagiarism>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Plagiarism

- “the use of others' published and unpublished ideas or words (or other intellectual property) without attribution or permission, and presenting them as new and original rather than derived from an existing source.”²

²“Publication Ethics Policies for Medical Journals” Prepared by the World Association of Medical Editors Publication Ethics Committee. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.wame.org/resources/publication-ethics-policies-for-medical-journals#plagiarism>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Technical Plagiarism

- “occurs when one inadvertently fails to properly cite, credit, and/or integrate a source, be it text, computer code, graphic, audio, or video information into one's work ... (and) can range in severity from an errant footnote, to incomplete citation information to "forgetting" to cite altogether.”³

³Marlboro College Graduate School [homepage on the Internet]. Vermont, USA: Marlboro College Graduate School; [cited 2010 November 07]. Available from: <http://gradschool.marlboro.edu/resources/legal>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Self - Plagiarism

- refers to the practice of an author using portions of their previous writings on the same topic in another of their publications, without specifically citing it formally in quotes,² and
- may give the impression that the present work is new and original, when in fact it is not.

²“Publication Ethics Policies for Medical Journals” Prepared by the World Association of Medical Editors Publication Ethics Committee. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.wame.org/resources/publication-ethics-policies-for-medical-journals#plagiarism>



Pursuing Plagiarism



General Types of Plagiarism⁴

- “cut and paste”
- “word-switch”
- “style”
- “metaphor”
- “idea”

⁴Barnbaum C. “Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It” [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from:

http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm



Pursuing Plagiarism



General Types of Plagiarism⁴

- **“cut and paste”**

literally lifting and applying words, phrases, sentences or paragraphs

"Any time you lift a sentence or significant phrase intact from a source, you must use quotations marks and reference the source."

⁷Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from:

http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm



Source Article:*

Especially since the launch of HST and the unprecedented clarity of the images satellites have given us, you've all seen on the news or in books, beautiful color pictures of various sights in the cosmos. But is this the way you would see these objects if you went there?
Well, to tackle that question, first we have to consider the nature of light and color. Light is made of waves of electromagnetic radiation. We perceive different wavelengths of visible light as different colors.

*Schilling G. Probing the Milky Way's Black Heart. *Science*, 1998; 282(5387):211-15

Cut & Paste PLAGIARISM

Everyone is interested in astronomical images, especially since the launch of HST and the unprecedented clarity of the images satellites have given us. But is this the way you would see these objects if you went there?

Barnbaum C. Plagiarism. [article on the web] Available from: http://ww2.valdosta.edu/~cbarnba u/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm Accessed 18 Jan 13

Pursuing Plagiarism



General Types of Plagiarism⁴

- **“word-switch”**

substituting words or paraphrasing without attribution

"If you take a sentence from a source and change around a few words, it is still plagiarism. Quoting Source articles should only be done if what the quote says is particularly useful in the point you are trying to make in what you are writing." In many cases, paraphrasing and then citing the original sources is a better option.

⁷Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from:

http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm



Source Article:

All solid bodies emit light: stars, rocks and people included. The temperature of the star, rock or person determines which wavelength of light will be most strongly radiated. In the constellation Orion, the upper left star is Betelgeuse (Armpit of the giant), 520 l-y distant. Betelgeuse is a supergiant star, 14,000 times brighter than our sun, and so big, if you were to put Betelgeuse in place of our sun, its surface would reach all the way out to Jupiter. Betelgeuse's color is bright red.

*Schilling G. Probing the Milky Way's Black Heart. *Science*, 1998; 282(5387):211-15

Word-switch PLAGIARISM

Stars, rocks and people all emit light, and which wavelength of light will be most strongly radiated depends on the temperature of the star, rock or person. For example, the star Betelgeuse in the constellation Orion, Armpit of the Giant, is a supergiant star, 14,000 times brighter than our own sun.

Pursuing Plagiarism



General Types of Plagiarism⁴

- “style”

following the flow of thought or reasoning style of another
"When you follow a Source Article sentence-by-sentence or paragraph-by-paragraph, it is plagiarism, even though none of your sentences are exactly like those in the source article or even in the same order. What you are copying is the author's reasoning style."

⁷Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from:

http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm



Pursuing Plagiarism



General Types of Plagiarism⁴

- “metaphor”

"Metaphors are used to make an idea clearer or give the reader an analogy that touches the senses or emotions better than a plain description of the object or process. Metaphors, are an important part of an author's creative style. If you cannot come up with your own metaphor to illustrate an important idea, use the metaphor in the Source Article, but give the author credit for it."

⁷Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from:

http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm



Source Article:*

This picture of the constellation Cygnus, the Swan, in visible light looks rather dull. Yet at an infrared wavelength of 60m the region looks very different. In infrared light we can see a glittering jewel-box of new born stars peeking out of the dust clouds that lie between us and the center of our Galaxy.

*Schilling G. Probing the Milky Way's Black Heart. *Science*, 1998; 282(5387):211-15

Metaphor PLAGIARISM

Although dusty clouds block our vision of stellar nurseries, infrared light reveals them. These newborns glitter like a jewel box and seem to be peeking at us from behind the dust obscuring them.

Pursuing Plagiarism



General Types of Plagiarism⁴

- “idea”

"If the author of the source article expresses a creative idea or suggests a solution to a problem (not in public domain), the idea or solution must be clearly attributed to the author. If you don't know what is accepted as public domain in a particular field, ASK."

⁷Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from: http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm



Source Article:*

Until now, infrared carbon stars have been classified as such due either to the presence of carbon-rich dust or to these stars' presence in region VII of the Habing diagram. Our visible spectra show conclusively that these stars are true carbon stars and do not have any O-rich molecules in their atmospheres. Their weak Ba lines might indicate an under-abundance of *s*-process elements. This important result, if true, would certainly separate infrared carbon stars from the optical population.

IDEA PLAGIARISM

Infrared carbon stars show weak Ba lines and this might mean that they do not have the normal amount of *s*-process elements in their atmospheres, making them decidedly a different type of star.

*Schilling G. Probing the Milky Way's Black Heart. *Science*, 1998; 282(5387):211-15

Don't use the word “novel” when you plagiarize

A pair of electrical engineers from Islamic Azad University, in Isfahan, Iran, has lost their 2012 article in *Computers in Biology and Medicine*, titled “A novel real-time patient-specific seizure diagnosis algorithm based on analysis of EEG and ECG signals using spectral and spatial features and improved particle swarm optimization classifier,” because, well, it wasn't. Turns out, the researchers lifted data from an Irish group who, several years earlier, had proposed their own “novel algorithm for neonatal seizure detection.”



As the admirably detailed [retraction notice explains](#):

This article has been retracted at the request of the Editor-in-Chief and Author.

The authors have plagiarized part of a paper that had already appeared in Clin. Neurophysiol. 118(6), 2007, pp.1348–1359, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.clinph.2007.02.015>.

Furthermore, Table 1 contains values taken from a database produced by the Neonatal Brain Research Group of University College Cork, Ireland, which also correspond with Table 1 of the Clin. Neurophysiol. paper.

Table 4 uses a dataset from Physionet (A. Shoeb, and J. Guttag. Application of Machine Learning to Epileptic Seizure Onset Detection. 27th International Conference on Machine Learning (ICML), June 21–24, 2010, Haifa, Israel).



Pursuing Plagiarism



Plagiarism

- gives the false impression that the words, ideas, composition or creation are those of the plagiarizer and not someone else's,
- or misleads the recipient about the nature of the plagiarized material.²

²“Publication Ethics Policies for Medical Journals” Prepared by the World Association of Medical Editors Publication Ethics Committee. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.wame.org/resources/publication-ethics-policies-for-medical-journals#plagiarism>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Pursuing Misconduct⁵

Editors have a duty to act if they suspect misconduct or if an allegation of misconduct is brought to them. This duty extends to both published and unpublished papers.

⁵Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. “Code of Conduct” and “Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors” UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Pursuing Misconduct⁵

Editors should not simply reject papers that raise concerns about possible misconduct. They are ethically obliged to pursue alleged cases.

⁵Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. “Code of Conduct” and “Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors” UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Pursuing Misconduct⁵

Editors should follow the COPE flowcharts where applicable.

- http://publicationethics.org/files/u2/02A_Plagiarism_Submitted.pdf
- http://publicationethics.org/files/u2/02B_Plagiarism_Published.pdf

⁵Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. “Code of Conduct” and “Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors” UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Pursuing Misconduct⁵

Editors should first seek a response from those suspected of misconduct. If they are not satisfied with the response, they should ask the relevant employers, or institution, or some appropriate body (perhaps a regulatory body or national research integrity organization) to investigate.

⁵Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. “Code of Conduct” and “Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors” UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



Pursuing Plagiarism



Pursuing Misconduct⁵

Editors should make all reasonable efforts to ensure that a proper investigation into alleged misconduct is conducted; if this does not happen, editors should make all reasonable attempts to persist in obtaining a resolution to the problem. This is an onerous but important duty.

⁵Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. “Code of Conduct” and “Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors” UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>

