### Procurement of medicines of local government units in the Philippines: A Pilot Study

Authors: KENT JASON CHENG ADOVICH RIVERA, MD JOJANA CHRISTINE GENERAL AMELYN ASENCE-MAMPORTE ALLAN ULITIN RED THADDEUS MIGUEL, MD, MBA IRENE FARINAS, MD, MPH KARINA SANTOS ANA MELISSA GUERRERO, MD, MPH HILTON LAM, MHA, PhD (Project Leader)

# Background

- RA 7581, the Price Act, and RA 9502, the Universally Accessible Cheaper and Quality Medicines Act of 2008 allowed the DOH to "monitor and regulate drug prices" to protect procuring government agencies from unreasonable drug prices.
- As per DOH DO 2014-0146, private and public facilities poorly comply with the required reporting of selling price of essential drugs via the online Essential Drug Price Monitoring System (EDPMS).
- Therefore, DOH PD created the Drug Price Reference Index (DPRI) to serve as a guide where government agencies can base the maximum reasonable purchase price of each drug they opt to buy.

### **Main Objective**

The objective of this study is to compare the prices of selected drugs in purposively-selected Luzon LGUs with the DPRI



- Price and quantities of a basket of drugs procured by the sampled LGUs from years 2014-2015
- Prices to be compared with the DPRI
- Prices which vary for the time period shall be weighted according to quantities. For example:

Amoxicillin 500 mg procured 2014-2015 by LGU A

| a. Quantity<br>Procured | b. Weight<br>based on<br>Quantity |     | c. Price<br>Procured | Column b. X<br>Column c. |
|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----|----------------------|--------------------------|
| 1,000                   | (                                 | 0.4 | PhP 7.00             | 2.80                     |
| 1,500                   | (                                 | 0.6 | 5.00                 | 3.00                     |
| TOTAL: 2,500            |                                   |     | Weighted F           | Price = PhP 5.80         |

Problems

Encountered

 Prices and quantities of a basket of drugs applicable per LGU shall be compared with the DPRI by aggregating into the following price index (Las Peyres):

$$L_{LGU} = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,LGU} q_{j,LGU}}{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,DPRI} q_{j,LGU}}$$

*p* is the price of drug *j* applicable in either the LGU or DPRI. *q* is the quantity.



$$L_{LGU} = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,LGU} q_{j,LGU}}{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,DPRI} q_{j,LGU}}$$

- Intuition:
  - This index shows the percent difference of the total LGU drug expenditure when the quantities procured were priced at LGU prices versus DPRI prices.
  - The lower  $L_{LGU}$  is, the better since it means that drug prices obtained by the LGU are near DPRI thresholds. The  $L_{LGU}$  is the main dependent variable.
- The  $L_{LGU}$  shall be the main dependent variable.



Problems Encountered



$$L_{LGU} = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,LGU} q_{j,LGU}}{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,DPRI} q_{j,LGU}}$$

#### Example for LGU X:

| Generic Name        | Quantity | LGU Average Price | DPRI price |
|---------------------|----------|-------------------|------------|
| Cetirizine Tab      | 5,000    | 1.35              | 1.29       |
| Chloramphenicol Cap | 1,000    | 2.75              | 2.16       |
| Cilostazol Tab      | 250      | 6.65              | 6.80       |
| Diltiazem Tab       | 500      | 18.50             | 17.61      |

 $L_{LGUX} = 1.07$ 

Objectives

Methodology

Problems Encountered

Results



$$L_{LGU} = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,LGU} q_{j,LGU}}{\sum_{j=1}^{n} p_{j,DPRI} q_{j,LGU}}$$

#### Example for LGU Y:

| Generic Name        | Quantity | LGU Average Price | DPRI price |
|---------------------|----------|-------------------|------------|
| Cetirizine Tab      | 5,000    | 1.29              | 1.29       |
| Chloramphenicol Cap | 1,000    | 2.16              | 2.16       |
| Cilostazol Tab      | 250      | 6.80              | 6.80       |
| Diltiazem Tab       | 500      | 17.61             | 17.61      |

 $L_{LGUY} = 1.00$ 

 $\therefore$  LGU Y follows the DPRI.

Methodology

Problems Encountered



# **Collecting Procurement Documents**

- Major issues:
  - Bureaucratic delays of DOH ROs
  - Some LGUs did not respond at all despite repeated follow-ups
  - Some LGUs claim that documents are either archived and hard to retrieve or are submitted to COA
  - Hospitals were more cooperative than LGUs



# **Collecting Procurement Documents**

- Solution applied:
  - PD asked the study team to halt data collection and instead, they collected purchase orders for us starting last January 19, 2017

*Caveat:* Getting only the POs (and not the other procurement documents) will only allow for an analysis of price and quantity data.

Total Data Yield versus Target: 31.25% (10 out of 32)

Objectives

Methodology

Problems Encountered

Results



10

#### Collected price and volume of LGUprocured drugs

• The Resulting LasPeyres Index

| Study Sitos               | LasPeyres | # of drugs and |  |  |
|---------------------------|-----------|----------------|--|--|
| Study Siles               | Index     | total qty.     |  |  |
| b_prov2_city_1            | 0.35      | 67; 215,722    |  |  |
| a_muni_3                  | 0.95      | 11; 117,270    |  |  |
| b_prov1_muni_3            | 2.01      | 43; 81,860     |  |  |
| a_hf_4 <sup>b</sup>       | 2.69      | 6; 3370        |  |  |
| b_prov1_hf_2 <sup>c</sup> | 3.72      | 74; 25,259     |  |  |
| a_city_2                  | 4.14      | 50; 73,792     |  |  |
| b_prov1_hf_1 <sup>c</sup> | 4.7       | 59; 41,825     |  |  |
| b_prov1_city_2            | 4.96      | 9; 14200       |  |  |
| b_prov1_muni_5            | 35.71     | 1; 5           |  |  |
| b_prov1_muni_2            | 212.7     | 1; 840         |  |  |

Objectives

Methodology

Problems Encountered

Results

#### Collected price and volume of LGUprocured drugs

#### Top 10 Most Procured Drugs

|                 | Deces               | Volume (# of                    | Price (Difference with DPRI) |                                    |       |        |                       |
|-----------------|---------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------------|-------|--------|-----------------------|
| Generic Name    | Strength or<br>Form | Study Sites<br>Which<br>Bought) | Median                       | Difference<br>of Median<br>vs DPRI | Min   | Max    | Standard<br>Deviation |
| Paracetamol     | 250 mg/5 mL,        | 42,912 (3)                      | 10.13                        | 0.82 x                             | 0.42  | 12.8   | 6.52                  |
|                 | 60 mL Bottle        |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Morphine (As    | 30 mg Tablet        | 40,000 (1)                      | 1.28                         | 0.04 x                             | N/A   | N/A    | N/A                   |
| Sulfate)        |                     |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Lagundi         | 300 mg Tablet       | 39,200 (1)                      | 1.48                         | 0.99 x                             | N/A   | N/A    | N/A                   |
| Amoxicillin     | 500 mg              | 24,800 (5)                      | 2.61                         | 2.07 x                             | 1.37  | 3.5    | 0.76                  |
|                 | Capsule             |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Paracetamol     | 500 mg Tablet       | 23,200 (3)                      | 0.49                         | 2.13 x                             | 0.26  | 0.70   | 0.22                  |
| Ascorbic Acid   | 500 mg Tablet       | 20,200 (2)                      | 47.03                        | 69.16 x                            | 1.24  | 92.82  | 64.76                 |
| (Vitamin C)     |                     |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Ferrous Sulfate | 60 mg Elem.         | 20,000 (1)                      | 0.55                         | 0.95 x                             | N/A   | N/A    | N/A                   |
| + Folic Acid    | Iron + 400 mcg      |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
|                 | Tablet              |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Mefenamic Acid  | 500 mg              | 17,950 (4)                      | 2.55                         | 3.44 x                             | 0.52  | 74.00  | 36.11                 |
|                 | Capsule             |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Mefenamic Acid  | 50 mg/5 mL,         | 16,370 (4)                      | 37.65                        | 3.77 x                             | 1.31  | 74.00  | 51.40                 |
|                 | 60 mL               |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
|                 | Suspension          |                                 |                              |                                    |       |        |                       |
| Cefuroxime      | 750 mg Vial         | 16,267 (5)                      | 158.70                       | 7.70 x                             | 63.60 | 256.62 | 85.63                 |

Objectives

Methodology

Problems Encountered

Results

# **Policy Recommendations**

- Strengthen the price and volume monitoring using a one-stop-shop online database
- Train purchasing officers (i.e. BAC, Supply Officer, etc.) in the GPRA
- Disseminate the use of DPRI
- Include the prices and volumes of LGU-procured drugs in the DPRI computation
- DOH PD can Collaborate with COA for Monitoring Prices of LGU-Procured Drug
- Further Studies to Evaluate the Transparency of LGUs
- Explore the use of the Presidential hotline, 8888

Methodology

Problems Encountered



# **Policy Recommendations**

Use the LasPeyres Index in drug price monitoring using the following suggested algorithm

| LasPeyres<br>Index Value | Priority | Interpretation   |
|--------------------------|----------|------------------|
| < 0.5                    | Highest  | Quality Red Flag |
| 0.5 to 1.5               | Minimal  | Acceptable Level |
| 1.5 to 5.0               | Average  | Price Issue      |
| 5.0 to 10                | High     | Price Issue      |
| > 10.0                   | Highest  | Price Issue      |

Objectives

Methodology Problems Encountered

Results



#### Thank you for your kind attention.