



Pursuing Plagiarism




Philippine Council for Health Research and Development  
Philippine Association of Medical Journal Editors  
Asia Pacific Association of Medical Journal Editors  
**National Medical Writing and Review Workshop**  
Marriott Hotel, Cebu City, January 19-20, 2012

JF Lapeña Jr. M.A., M.D., F.P.C.S.  
lapenajf@upm.edu.ph



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



*Vesalius (1514 BC) spent sleepless nights after shipping the blocks of his anatomical drawings to a printer in Basel. He feared that his rival anatomists might seize those blocks and print them under their own names.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:  
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

**INTRODUCTION**



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



*Even the great Galen was said to have copied several concepts from his predecessors and claimed them as his own.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:  
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

**INTRODUCTION**



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



*Lavoisier (16<sup>th</sup> century) stole the discovery of Oxygen from Priestley and the discovery of water from Cavendish. Fortunately the credit is restored to original discoverers in both cases.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:  
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

**INTRODUCTION**



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



*In fact Priestley himself got the idea (Idea theft) from Cavendish. Michael Faraday, John Dalton, and many more of those days got ideas copied from Cavendish.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:  
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

**INTRODUCTION**



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



*Charles Darwin got the idea of "Descent of Man" from John Hunter's collection and writings, but carefully avoided mentioning the fact (albeit he referred to Hunter in several places of his book).*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from:  
<http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>

**INTRODUCTION**




University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



*Even John and his brother William Hunter accused each other of plagiarism and separated on the issue of credit of discovery of placental circulation.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from: <http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>



**INTRODUCTION**


University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



*After the demise of John Hunter his brother-in-law Sir Everard Home stole Hunter's research findings (lab notes) and published a series of highly acclaimed papers in his name. He was even awarded an FRS based on the plagiarized publications.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from: <http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>



**INTRODUCTION**

University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



*He was caught when he tried to burn Hunter's original notes which were no longer required of him.*

*The smoke evolving from the chimney provoked an inquiry and a court case thereon.*


Robinson V. Pathfinders in Medicine NY: Medical Review of Reviews 1912 [cited 2011 August 29]. Available from: <http://www.ebooksread.com/authors-eng/victor-robinson/pathfinders-in-medicine-ala/1-pathfinders-in-medicine-ala.shtml>



**INTRODUCTION**


University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



*In the August 2010 issue of Anesthesia & Analgesia, a highly regarded specialty journal, five researchers from the University of Pennsylvania, led by Andrew Ochroch, made a remarkable confession.*


Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. *Anesth Analg*. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.



**INTRODUCTION**


University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



*Their article in the May issue of A&A on ventilation of patients recovering from bariatric surgery plagiarized a 2009 paper in a competing publication, Anesthesiology, written by the same group.*


Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. *Anesth Analg*. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.



**INTRODUCTION**


University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism



*"We sincerely apologize for the inappropriate and unacceptable intellectual overlap and self-plagiarism of our paper ... published in Anesthesiology."*


Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. *Anesth Analg*. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.



**INTRODUCTION**

University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



*"In presenting the results of the two studies, we duplicated much of the Introduction, structure of the Methods and Results, and the Discussion sections. Despite the data being original in each paper, this is a clear violation of the policies [of both journals]."*


Neligan P, Williams N, Greenblatt E, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Retraction letter for Neligan P, Malhotra G, Fraser MW, Williams N, Greenblatt EP, Cereda M, Ochroch EA. Noninvasive ventilation immediately after extubation improves lung function in morbidly obese patients with obstructive sleep apnea undergoing laparoscopic bariatric surgery. *Anesthesia & Analgesia* 2010;110:1360-5. *Anesth Analg*. 2010 Aug;111(2):576.

### INTRODUCTION



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### This session will discuss:


- The definitions of plagiarism, technical plagiarism and self-plagiarism;
- The general types of plagiarism; and
- The 2011 Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) Code of Conduct and Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors for pursuing misconduct.

### OBJECTIVES



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### This presentation is based on:


Lapeña JF. Plagiarism and plunder: Fabrication and falsification. *Philippine Journal of Otolaryngology Head and Neck Surgery* 2010 Jul-Dec 25 (2):4-5.

### REFERENCE



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### Plagiarism


- from "Latin *plagiarius* 'kidnapper, seducer, plunderer,' used in the sense of 'literary thief' by Martial, from *plagium* 'kidnapping,' from *plaga* 'snare, net.'"<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>"Plagiarism," in *Online Etymology Dictionary*. Douglas Harper, Historian. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.etymonline.com/index.php?term=plagiarism>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### Plagiarism


- "the use of others' published and unpublished ideas or words (or other intellectual property) without attribution or permission, and presenting them as new and original rather than derived from an existing source."<sup>2</sup>

<sup>2</sup>"Publication Ethics Policies for Medical Journals" Prepared by the World Association of Medical Editors Publication Ethics Committee. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.wame.org/resources/publication-ethics-policies-for-medical-journals#plagiarism>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### Technical Plagiarism


- "occurs when one inadvertently fails to properly cite, credit, and/or integrate a source, be it text, computer code, graphic, audio, or video information into one's work ... (and) can range in severity from an errant footnote, to incomplete citation information to "forgetting" to cite altogether."<sup>3</sup>

<sup>3</sup>Marlboro College Graduate School [homepage on the Internet]. Vermont, USA: Marlboro College Graduate School; [cited 2010 November 07]. Available from: <http://gradschool.marlboro.edu/resources/legal>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### Self - Plagiarism


- refers to the practice of an author using portions of their previous writings on the same topic in another of their publications, without specifically citing it formally in quotes,<sup>2</sup> and
- may give the impression that the present work is new and original, when in fact it is not.

<sup>2</sup>Publication Ethics Policies for Medical Journals" Prepared by the World Association of Medical Editors Publication Ethics Committee. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.wame.org/resources/publication-ethics-policies-for-medical-journals#plagiarism>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### General Types of Plagiarism<sup>4</sup>


- "cut and paste"
- "word-switch"
- "style"
- "metaphor"
- "idea"

<sup>4</sup>Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from: [http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching\\_MISC/plagiarism.htm](http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm)



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### General Types of Plagiarism<sup>4</sup>


- "cut and paste"  
literally lifting and applying words, phrases, sentences or paragraphs

<sup>4</sup>Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from: [http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching\\_MISC/plagiarism.htm](http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm)



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### General Types of Plagiarism<sup>4</sup>


- "word-switch"  
substituting words or paraphrasing without attribution

<sup>4</sup>Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from: [http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching\\_MISC/plagiarism.htm](http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm)



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### General Types of Plagiarism<sup>4</sup>


- "style"  
following the flow of thought or reasoning style of another

<sup>4</sup>Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from: [http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching\\_MISC/plagiarism.htm](http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm)



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


## Pursuing Plagiarism



### General Types of Plagiarism<sup>4</sup>


- "metaphor" and "idea"  
metaphors or ideas of another are used without proper acknowledgement

<sup>4</sup>Barnbaum C. "Plagiarism: A Student's Guide to Recognizing It and Avoiding It" [monograph on the Internet]. Georgia: Valdosta State University Department of Physics and Astronomy. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from: [http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching\\_MISC/plagiarism.htm](http://www.valdosta.edu/~cbarnbau/personal/teaching_MISC/plagiarism.htm)



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



**Plagiarism**


- gives the false impression that the words, ideas, composition or creation are those of the plagiarizer and not someone else's,
- or misleads the recipient about the nature of the plagiarized material.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>2</sup>Publication Ethics Policies for Medical Journals\* Prepared by the World Association of Medical Editors Publication Ethics Committee. [cited 2010 November 06]. Available from <http://www.wame.org/resources/publication-ethics-policies-for-medical-journals#plagiarism>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



**Pursuing Misconduct<sup>5</sup>**


Editors have a duty to act if they suspect misconduct or if an allegation of misconduct is brought to them. This duty extends to both published and unpublished papers.

<sup>5</sup>Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. "Code of Conduct" and "Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors" UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



**Pursuing Misconduct<sup>5</sup>**


Editors should not simply reject papers that raise concerns about possible misconduct. They are ethically obliged to pursue alleged cases.

<sup>5</sup>Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. "Code of Conduct" and "Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors" UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER

Pursuing Plagiarism




**Pursuing Misconduct<sup>5</sup>**

Editors should follow the COPE flowcharts where applicable.


- [http://publicationethics.org/files/u2/02A\\_Plagiarism\\_Submitted.pdf](http://publicationethics.org/files/u2/02A_Plagiarism_Submitted.pdf)
- [http://publicationethics.org/files/u2/02B\\_Plagiarism\\_Published.pdf](http://publicationethics.org/files/u2/02B_Plagiarism_Published.pdf)

<sup>5</sup>Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. "Code of Conduct" and "Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors" UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



**Pursuing Misconduct<sup>5</sup>**


Editors should first seek a response from those suspected of misconduct. If they are not satisfied with the response, they should ask the relevant employers, or institution, or some appropriate body (perhaps a regulatory body or national research integrity organization) to investigate.

<sup>5</sup>Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. "Code of Conduct" and "Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors" UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER


Pursuing Plagiarism



**Pursuing Misconduct<sup>5</sup>**

Editors should make all reasonable efforts to ensure that a proper investigation into alleged misconduct is conducted; if this does not happen, editors should make all reasonable attempts to persist in obtaining a resolution to the problem. This is an onerous but important duty.

<sup>5</sup>Committee on Publication Ethics [homepage on the Internet]. "Code of Conduct" and "Best Practice Guidelines for Journal Editors" UK: Committee on Publication Ethics. [cited 2011 August 08] Available from: <http://publicationethics.org/guidelines>



University of the Philippines Manila  
THE HEALTH SCIENCES CENTER